

DRAFT MINUTES

JOINT MEETING of the STATE REVIEW BOARD and HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

December 6, 2006, 10:00 a.m.

Halsey Lecture Hall - Virginia Historical Society
428 North Boulevard, Richmond, Virginia 23221

State Review Board Members Present

Warren Hofstra, Chair
Carl Lounsbury, Vice-Chair
Ann Alexander
Lauranett Lee
Elizabeth Moore
Madison Spencer

Historic Resources Board Members Present

Addison Thompson, Chair
Patrick Butler, Vice-Chair
John Braymer
Jeanne Evans
Rachel Flynn
Ora McCoy
Helen Murphy

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Kathleen Kilpatrick, Director
Catherine Slusser, Deputy Director
Ann Andrus
Francine Archer
Mike Barber
Camille Bowman
Karen Brandt
Bob Carter
David Edwards
Joanie Evans
Randy Jones
John Kern

Calder Loth
Diana Martin
Jean McRae
Wendy Musumeci
Mike Pulice
Olga Skorackyj
Susan Smead
Alison Snow
Kelly Spradley-Kurowski
Elizabeth Tune
Marc Wagner

State Review Board (SRB)

Chair Hofstra called the State Review Board meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. He read the role of the board, asked the other members to introduce themselves, and then explained the process of registration.

The minutes from the September 6, 2006 meeting were approved with a motion from Ms. Lee and a second from Ms. Moore. There was neither new nor old business.

Historic Resources Board (HRB)

Chair Thompson called the Historic Resources Board meeting to order and welcomed everyone in attendance. He explained the role of the board then asked each member to introduce themselves.

The minutes from the September 6, 2006 meeting were approved with a motion from Mr. Braymer and a second from Ms. Murphy. Under new business, Chair Thompson asked for nominations for a new Chair and Vice-chair. With a motion from Ms. Flynn and a second from Mr. Braymer, Mr. Butler was voted in as Chair and Ms. Murphy as Vice-chair. There was no old business.

Director's Report (DHR)

Director Kilpatrick welcomed everyone in attendance and congratulated Mr. Butler and Ms. Murphy on their appointment to the HRB. She then introduced new DHR staff and described several of the shifts within the current staff.

Director Kilpatrick highlighted key achievements of the Department and spoke of continued initiatives for the coming year. She spoke of the General Assembly, state and legislative issues, and upcoming conferences at which DHR will jointly participate. Finally, she highlighted items on the day's agenda.

Register Nominations

The register section of the meeting began with Ms. Andrus who presented the following nominations for the Capital Region.

1. Bel Aire, Albemarle County (Earlsville Quad), #002-0001, Criteria B and C
2. The Boxley Place, Louisa County (Louisa Quad), #254-0042, Criterion C
3. Broad Street Comm. Historic District, Boundary Increase, City of Richmond, #127-0375, Criteria A and C
4. Elk Hill, Nelson County (Sherando and Horseshoe Mtn Quads), #062-0005, Criteria A and C
5. Eubank Hall, Lunenburg County (Fort Mitchell Quad), #055-0038, Criterion C
6. Forest Hill, Amherst County (Piney River Quad), #005-0108, Criteria B and C
7. Mechum River Farm, Albemarle County (Crozet Quad), #002-1632, Criterion C
8. Tinsley Tavern, Goochland County (Caledonia Quad), #037-0032, Criteria A and C

With a motion from Mr. Lounsbury and a second from Ms. Lee, all eight nominations from the Capital Region were approved by the SRB, and then with a motion from Ms. Murphy and a second from Ms. Evans, all were approved for listing on the Virginia Landmarks Register (VLR) by the HRB.

Mr. Edwards presented the following nominations for the Northern Region:

9. Holmes Run Acres HD, Fairfax County (Annandale Quad), #029-5183, Criterion C, Consideration G
10. Marshall Historic District, Fauquier County (Marshall Quad), #030-5156, Criteria A and C
11. Paris Historic District, Fauquier County (Ashby Gap Quad), #030-0222, Criteria A and C
12. Purcellville Historic District, Loudoun County (Purcellville Quad), #286-5001, Criteria A and C
13. Western State Hospital, Boundary Increase, City of Staunton, #132-0009, Criteria A and C

The following comments were made:

Chair Hofstra inquired about the restoration project for Western State Hospital. Director Kilpatrick explained the mixed-use proposal with high-end as well as affordable housing and commercial use. Ms. Lee asked of the racial make-up of the Holmes Run Acres district now and in the past. Mr. Rupp from the neighborhood explained the early dynamics and how they had become multi-cultural.

Then with a motion from Ms. Lee and a second from Mr. Lounsbury, all five nominations from the Northern Region were approved by the SRB, and with a motion from Mr. Butler and a second from Ms. McCoy, all were approved for listing on the VLR by the HRB.

Mr. Pulice presented the following nomination for the Roanoke Region.

14. Edgewood, Henry County (Martinsville West), #044-5172, Criterion C
15. Margaret E. Poague House, Rockbridge County (Natural Bridge Quad), #081-7070, Criterion C
16. Richlands Historic District, Tazewell County (Richlands Quad), #148-5014, Criteria A and C
17. Roanoke Downtown Historic District, Boundary Increase, City of Roanoke, #128-5761, Criteria A and C
18. Reverend Robert Childress Presbyterian Rock Churches, MPD, #017-5032

Individual Churches eligible all under Criteria A and C, Criteria Consideration A and D

19. Bluemont Presbyterian Church and Cemetery, Patrick County (Laurel Fork Quad), #070-5044
20. Buffalo Mountain Presbyterian Church and Cemetery, Carroll County (Dugspur Quad), #017-5016
21. Dinwiddie Presbyterian Church and Cemetery, Carroll County (Hillsville Quad), #017-5015
22. Mayberry Presbyterian Church, Patrick County (Meadows of Dan Quad), #070-5045
23. Slate Mountain Presbyterian Church and Cemetery, Floyd County (Willis Quad), #031-5005
24. Willis Presbyterian Church and Cemetery, Floyd County (Willis Quad), #031-0045

The following comments were made:

Chair Hofstra asked if Reverend Childress had served at all the churches. Mr. Kern provided further information on the Rock Churches, their ownership, and history.

Then with a motion from Ms. Moore and a second from Ms. Lee, all eleven nominations from the Roanoke Region were approved by the SRB, and with a motion from Ms. Murphy and a second from Ms. McCoy, all were approved for listing on the VLR by the HRB.

Finally, Ms. Bowman presented the following nominations from the Tidewater Region.

25. Chamberlin Hotel, City of Hampton (Hampton Quad), #114-0114, Criterion C
26. Ivy Hill Cemetery, Isle of Wight County (Smithfield Quad), #300-5005, Criterion C, Consideration D
27. Woodhouse House, City of Virginia Beach (Pleasant Ridge Quad), #134-0058, Criterion C
28. Zion Methodist Church, City of Norfolk (Norfolk North Quad), #122-0110, Criterion C, Consideration A

The following comments were made:

Ms. Lee inquired into the impact of the closing of the hotel and the demographics of the area. Director Kilpatrick and Ms. Bowman commented on the closing of the Fort, the private ownership of the hotel itself, and the future use and tax credit work of the hotel.

With a motion from Mr. Lounsbury and a second from Ms. Alexander, the four nominations for the Tidewater Region were approved by the SRB, and with a motion from Mr. Braymer and a second from Ms. Flynn, they were approved by the HRB for listing on the VLR. Finally, Director Kilpatrick thanked Chair Thompson for his service as Chairman of the Historic Resources Board, and the Boards recessed for lunch.

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

Chair Thompson brought the HRB back to order just before 1:00 p.m. and Ms. Archer presented the following Highway Markers for approval.

1. Middlesex County Courthouse
Proposed Marker Location: Route 33 East, Middlesex County
Sponsor: Middlesex County Museum, P O Box 121, Saluda, VA 23149, 804-758-3663
2. Pound Virginia
Proposed Marker Location: Business Route 23 across from Foodland Grocery, Pound, Wise County
Sponsor: Historical Society of the Pound, P.O. Box 373, Pound, Virginia 24279
3. Andrew Zirkle Mill
Proposed Location: Southside of Route 767, Forestville
Sponsor: Robert B. Andrews and Sherryl A. Belinsky
4. Ella Fitzgerald
Proposed Location: Newport News (possibly the street where she lived at 2 years of age)
Sponsor: Virginia Department of Historic Resources
5. Matilda Sisserietta Jones
Proposed Location: Portsmouth (to be determined)
Sponsor: Virginia Department of Historic Resources
6. Adam Thorowgood
Proposed Location: Rte 60, 4200 Shore Dr. or Rte 60, 4300 Shore Dr., or Rte 58, 4100 Va Beach Blvd, Virginia Beach
Sponsor: Students at the Thorowgood Elementary School, 1444 Dunston Lane, Virginia Beach
7. Cavalry Action at Cold Harbor
Proposed Location: Dunham Subdivision, Hanover County
Sponsor: Godsey Properties, Inc. Alvin Clark, 2461 Charles city Road, Richmond, VA 23231

Replacement Markers:

1. Ware Parish Church
Proposed Location: US Route 14, 1 mile east of Gloucester Gloucester County
Sponsor: Ware Episcopal Church, 7825 John Clayton Mem. Hwy, PO Box 616 Gloucester, VA 23061, 804-693-3821.
2. First Battle of Winchester
Proposed Location: Rte. 11 (Valley Avenue), north of Weems Lane, Winchester
Sponsor: Virginia Department of Historic Resources

Mr. Butler asked about verifying the dates and rectangular design of the Ware Church. Then with a motion from Ms. McCoy and a second from Mr. Butler all nine markers were approved, with the understanding that the Board would see the final text of the Ware Church Highway marker before it was ordered.

Easements

Mr. Loth presented the following easements which had been executed since the September 2006 Board meeting.

1. Burgh Westra, Gloucester County
Donors: Mr. and Mrs. Thomas Marshall Boyd
Land included: 38.92 acres
2. Conjuror's Neck Archeological District: Old Brick House
Donors: Old Brick House Foundation
Land included: Suburban Lot (General Assembly Grant generated easement)
3. Long Meadows, Frederick County
Donors: Mr. and Mrs. Jack S. Carothers
Land included: 36.97 acres (Easement was signed on December 27, 2005; however subordination from the lienholder was not received until July 27, 2006, and we did not receive the easement for signing until the middle of October.)

Mr. Loth continued by presenting the following easements for consideration.

1. Hanger Mill, Augusta County
Donor: J. B. Hanger, Jr.
Land included: 7.5 acres
2. Mount Pleasant, Westmoreland County
Donors: William T. Carden and Martha S. Carden
Land Included: 46.255 acres
3. Cobbs Hall, Northumberland County
Donors: Richard Bland Lee
Land Included: 6.91 acres
4. Carlyle House, Alexandria
Donor: Northern Virginia Regional Park Authority
Land included: City lot
5. Pilgrims Rest, Prince William County (Easement Amendment)
Donors: Rodney J. Klima and Carol Snider Klima
Land Included: 23.9 acres

Then Ms. Musumeci continued presenting the following easements for consideration.

6. Metzger Tract: Waterford Historic District, Loudoun County
Donors: Ruth Owen Metzger Whitlock, Elizabeth White Metzger & Mary Ellen Metzger LeCompte
Land included: village lot
7. Old Acre (James Steer House), Waterford Historic District, Loudon County
Donors: Mr. and Mrs. Joel Steer
Land Included: half acre
8. Western Tract at Chancellorsville, Spotsylvania County
Donors: Civil War Preservation Trust
Land Included: 74 acres
9. Warriner Tract at Glendale, Henrico County
Donors: Civil War Preservation Trust
Land Included: 220 acres
10. White Oak Road Tract, Dinwiddie County
Donors: Partially Owned by Civil War Preservation Trust
Land Included: 647.5 acres
11. Buckland Properties, Prince William County
Donor: Thomas Ashe, Sr.
Land Included: 4 suburban lots
The Buckland Tavern; The John Trone House; The Buckland Methodist Church; Richard Gill House
12. Buchanan Theater, Buchanan Historic District, Botetourt County
Donors: S. Dale and Gloria Carter
Land Included: City lot

Ms. Tune explained the DHR Easement Committee's concern regarding the Theater and said the committee recommended not accepting an easement on this resource.

With a motion from Ms. McCoy and a second from Mr. Butler, the amendment easement for Pilgrim's Rest was approved, and with a motion from Ms. Murphy and a second from Ms. Evans the easement for the Buchanan Theater was declined. Then with a motion from Ms. McCoy and a second from Ms. Flynn all the other easements, except the Metzger property, were approved. Finally, with Chair Thompson excused from the room and Vice-chair Butler calling for a vote, Ms. Flynn motioned and Ms. Murphy seconded, and the Metzger easement was approved.

The following previous easement issue updates were made: Elk Hill ownership and right-of-way concerns; Berry Hill future use and ownership; Justice Black House subdivision withdrawn; easement policy and procedure documents underway.

Chair Thompson thanked everyone and adjourned the Historic Resources Board meeting.

STATE REVIEW BOARD

Chair Hofstra brought the SRB to order around 12:50 p.m. in the Collections Study Room of the Department of Historic Resources for discussion and endorsement of the Preliminary Information Applications (informal guidance session).

Board Members (b) and Staff (s) present: Ann Alexander (b), Laurant Lee (b), Carl Lounsbury (b), Elizabeth Moore (b), Ann Andrus (s), Camille Bowman (s), Bob Carter (s), David Edwards (s), Joanie Evans (s), John Kern (s), Diana Martin (s), Michael Pulice (s), Catherine Slusser (s), Susan Smead (s), Kelly Spradley-Kurowski (s), and Marc Wagner(s)

Guests (from sign in sheet): Ruth and Lowell Tolliver (Dallard-Newman House), Prof. Burt Rodriguez (Currie House), John Quarstein (Lee Hall Depot), Robert and Kathy Ellis (Clifton Farm), and Bryan Green (Richmond Locomotive)

Preliminary Information Applications

All proposals were endorsed, except where noted, with the following comments:

1. Carlton Terrace Apartments, City of Roanoke, DHR File Number 128-6120, Criteria A and C
The board recommended that Criterion A be developed much more thoroughly in the upcoming nomination.
2. Copeland House, Henry County, DHR File Number 044-5179, Criteria A and C
The Board recommended developing Criterion A more fully for the upcoming nomination.
3. Moonlite Theatre, Washington County, DHR File Number 095-5256, Criteria A and C
4. Dallard-Newman House, City of Harrisonburg, DHR File Number 115-5058, Criterion B
The Board advised the owners on the best ways to proceed with the nomination.
5. Clifton Farm, Culpeper County, DHR File Number 023-5230, Criteria A, C, and D
The Board confirmed asked the owners to provide confirmation of the archaeological sites on the property, and advised on how to proceed with the nomination. It was noted that Military should not be included in the Areas of Significance, but was checked by mistake on the rating sheet.
6. Lee Hall Depot, City of Newport News, DHR File Number 121-0014, Criteria A and C
The Board confirmed that the Lee Hall Depot would retain its potential eligibility if moved according to plans dated November 18, 2005.
7. Currie House, Town of Blacksburg, DHR File Number 150-5045, Criterion C, Criterion Consideration G
The Board and staff engaged in discussion with the applicant regarding the necessary historic context for the Currie House, noting that the academic scholarship needed to evaluate such a young property may not exist yet. The Board determined that more opinion from specialists in modern design would be necessary before they would feel comfortable making an exception to the NPS 50-year rule. The staff's position of not potentially eligible was not overturned.
8. Richmond Locomotive and Machine Works, City of Richmond, DHR File Number 127-6188, Criteria A and C
The applicant provided additional photo documentation, and the Board recommended that the business history be strengthened in the upcoming nomination, including discussion specific to the activities at the Boulevard location.
9. Fort Colvin, Frederick County, DHR File Number 034-0026, Criteria A, C, and D
The Board discussed and clarified the building plan type.
10. Rockcroft/Osborne House, Clarke County, DHR File Number 168-5028, Criteria B and C
The Board recommended strengthening the argument under Criterion B.
11. Woodside, Spotsylvania County, DHR File Number 088-0072, Criteria C and D
12. Beaton-Powell House, Southampton County, DHR File Number 174-5002-0016, Criteria A and C

The Board noted that balloon framing in 1857 was not likely, and asked for clarification when the nomination comes forward, and recommended developing Criterion A more fully.

13. Fort Nelson DAR Chapter House, City of Portsmouth, DHR File Number 044-5179, Criteria A and C

The Board recommended developing Criterion A more fully.

14. The Old Store, Matthews County, DHR File Number 057-5027, Criteria A and C

The Board recommended developing Criterion A more fully.

15. Bear Castle, Louisa County, DHR File Number 054-0080

The board requested that the construction date be re-evaluated, noting that the building appeared no earlier than late 18th century.

16. Cool Well, Hanover County, DHR File Number 042-0248, Criteria A and C

17. Department of Public Utilities, Howard Road Complex, City of Richmond, DHR File Number 127-6184, Criteria A and C

18. McCallum Moore Museum and Gardens, Mecklenburg County, DHR File Number 186-5001, Criterion C

19. James Nimmo House, City of Charlottesville, DHR File Number 104-5045, Criteria A and B

The State Review Board adjourned.